

FINANCE COMMITTEE MEETING MINUTES

The Standing Committee on Finance met on *Tuesday, April 18, 2023 at 7:00 PM* in the *Council Chambers, Brockton City Hall, 45 School Street*, to consider the following:

Public Hearing:

1. Ordered: That the common necessity and convenience of the inhabitants of the City of Brockton require the laying out and acceptance of **Oscar Avenue**, extending from Sprague Avenue, westerly 1,225 feet, more or less, and for that purpose it is necessary to take an easement for **Highway Purposes** and lay out as a public street or way of said City of Brockton, said easement passing by or over lands of those persons shown on "EXHIBIT A", attached hereto and parties unknown. Said layout of said street, being 50.00 feet in width is shown more particularly on the following described plans:
 1. Land Court Plan 29550 C entitled "Subdivision of Land in Brockton, Land Surveys, Inc., Surveyors", dated May 6, 1976.
 2. Land Court Plan **32844 A** (Sheets 1 and 2), entitled "Plan of Land in Brockton, Roy C. Anderson, Jr., Surveyor" dated December 20, 1963, and September 20 1965.
 3. Land Court Plan **32844 D** entitled "Subdivision Plan of Land in Brockton, Roy C. Anderson, Jr., Surveyor", dated September 2, 1971.
 4. Land Court Plan **32844 F** entitled "Subdivision Plan of Land in Brockton, Roy C. Anderson, Jr., Surveyor", dated November 3, 1971 and February 3, 1972.
 5. Land Court Plan **33765 A** entitled "Plan of Land in Brockton, L. W. DeCelle Surveyors, Inc., dated January 17, 1962 and December 24, 1965.
 6. Land Court Plan **33765 B** entitled "Subdivision Plan of Land in Brockton, DeCa Engineering, Inc., Surveyors", dated April 24, 1967.
 7. Land Court Plan **38350 A** entitled "Plan of Land in Brockton, Joseph Selwyn, Surveyor", dated November 19, 1973.
 8. Land Court Plan **39764 A** entitled "Plan of Land in Brockton, Hayward – Boynton & Williams, Inc., Surveyors", dated December 9 1977.

The land taken is more fully described as follows:

All the land within the limits of a private way known as **Oscar Avenue**, supposed to belong to parties unknown, being a strip of land 50.00 feet in width, extending from Sprague Avenue westerly, a distance of about 1,225 feet, more or less, as shown on the here-in described plans and to which reference is hereby made for a more particular description. And we have considered and estimated the damages sustained by all persons who have not waived damages in their several estates as follows:

NO AWARDS. Exhibit A, Layout

Invited: Patrick Hill, Commissioner of DPW

Councilor Lally

- Letter sent to residents is not easy to understand exactly what they are doing and wants residents to understand the work being done.

Patrick Hill, Commissioner of DPW

- The street will benefit from being able to use city funds for needed repairs.

Councilor Lally

- Verifying the legal width of street and that this is not extending or altering the existing street. Just to resurface.

Having considered the same, motion by Councilor Thompson to report FAVORABLE, 2nd by Councilor Asack. Motion carried by a hand vote.

Public Hearing Closed

2. Appointment of Frederick M. McDermott of 976 Ash Street Brockton, MA 02301 to the Elections Commission as a Commissioner for a four (4) year term, ending March 2027.

Invited: Frederick M. McDermott

Councilor Farwell

- There is an error, this should read as a reappointment.

Having considered the same, motion by Councilor Farwell to report FAVORABLE, 2nd by Councilor Asack. Motion carried by a hand vote.

3. Reappointment of Toni L. Goncalves of 154 Fairview Ave, Brockton MA to the City of Brockton Planning Board as a member for a five (5) year term, ending March 2028.

Invited: Toni L. Goncalves

Having considered the same, motion by Councilor Asack to report FAVORABLE, 2nd by Councilor Minichiello. Motion carried by a hand vote.

4. Reappointment of Cindy Ethier-Kostka of 50 Centre Street #311, Brockton MA to the City of Brockton Cemetery Board of Trustees as a member for a five (5) year term, ending March 2028.

Invited: Cindy Ethier-Kostka

Councilor Rodrigues

- Why is there a limit of people being serviced?

Cindy Ethier-Kostka

- There is not enough staff, need to hire.
- The city needs to appropriate more money to the cemeteries.
- The board needs to meet more often, suggest quarterly at a minimum.

Councilor Rodrigues

- Something needs to give and not fair that other cemeteries can do more than 2 burials.
- Going to file a resolve to cemetery and parks to discuss this situation.

Councilor Farwell

- Who calls the meetings?

Cindy Ethier-Kostka

- Mayor is chair and co-chair is Tim Carpenter.

Having considered the same, motion by Councilor Asack to report FAVORABLE, 2nd by Councilor Thompson. Motion carried by a hand vote.

5. Reappointment of Matthieu C. Delisme of 14 Clifford Ave, Brockton MA 02301 to the City of Brockton Library Board of Trustees as a member for a three (3) year term, ending March 2026.

Invited: Matthieu C. Delisme

Having considered the same, motion by Councilor Asack to report FAVORABLE, 2nd by Councilor Rodrigues. Motion carried by a hand vote.

6. Appointment of Shareefah K. Mapp of 45 Hillberg Ave, Brockton MA to the City of Brockton Conservation Commission as a commissioner for a three (3) year term, ending March 2026.

Invited: Shareefah K. Mapp

Having considered the same, motion by Councilor Thompson to report FAVORABLE, 2nd by Councilor Asack. Motion carried by a hand vote.

7. Appointment of Fabienne Myra Zephyr of 17 Cambo Street, Brockton MA 02301 to the Council on Aging as a member for a three (3) year term, ending March 2026.

Invited: Fabienne Myra Zephyr

Having considered the same, motion by Councilor Thompson to report FAVORABLE, 2nd by Councilor Asack. Motion carried by a hand vote.

Motion from Councilor Farwell to take items 8-11 collectively, 2nd by Councilor Rodrigues. Motion carried by a hand vote.

8. Appointment of the following candidate to the City of Brockton Beautification Committee as members for a one (1) year term, ending March 2024: Kelly M. Hanlon of 96 Westfield Drive, Brockton MA.

Invited: Kelly M. Hanlon

9. Appointment of the following candidate to the City of Brockton Beautification Committee as members for a one (1) year term, ending March 2024: Linda R. Pietrantonio of 55 John Berman Drive, Brockton, MA.
Invited: Linda R. Pietrantonio
10. Appointment of the following candidate to the City of Brockton Beautification Committee as members for a one (1) year term, ending March 2024: Shareefah K. Mapp of 45 Hillberg Ave, Brockton MA.
Invited: Shareefah K. Mapp
11. Appointment of the following candidate to the City of Brockton Beautification Committee as members for a one (1) year term, ending March 2024: Shelly A. Jackson of 29 Keswick Rd, Brockton MA.
Invited: Shelly A. Jackson

Councilor Asack

- Members have been cleaning the city for 10 years. Would like to thank members.

Having considered the same, motion by Councilor Asack to report items 8-11 as FAVORABLE, 2nd by Councilor D'Agostino. Motion carried by a hand vote.

12. Ordered: That sum of \$5,550,000 is appropriated to pay costs of acquiring a parcel or parcels of land located at 1782 Main Street in Brockton, by eminent domain or otherwise, including the payment of all costs incidental and related thereto, including renovations and all furnishings and equipment necessary, and that to meet this appropriation, the Treasurer, with the approval of the Mayor, is authorized to borrow said amount under and pursuant to G.L. c. 44, §7(1) or pursuant to any other enabling authority, and to issue bonds or notes of the City therefor.

Further Ordered: That the City Treasurer is authorized to file an application with The Commonwealth of Massachusetts' Municipal Finance Oversight Board to qualify under M.G.L. c. 44A any and all bonds or notes of the City authorized by this vote, and to provide such information and execute such documents as the Municipal Finance Oversight Board of The Commonwealth of Massachusetts may require.

Invited: Troy Clarkson, Chief Financial Officer

Martin Brophy, Treasurer/Collector

Rob May, Director of Planning and Economic Development

Aldo Petronio, Chief Financial Officer of Schools

- The city has been searching for a property for over a year to house the busses. Large enough lots are not plentiful There has been an evaluation of the property soil and building for environmental concerns. The building has been there since 1925.
- Will be able to house 65 larger busses and 68 smaller busses. Personal employee parking may be a concern.
- The building used to be a car shop and has lifts. Would need to install larger bus lifts.

- The larger lifts could also service DPW city vehicles.
- Would need clean up and flooding from Salisbury River could be a concern but we could move to the high school.
- This would be a bonded note for 20 years and is less than the current lease at the fairgrounds. Instead of paying a lease we would own the property in 20 years.

Councilor Farwell

- From Council President, the property is appraised at \$1.469M but asking \$5.5M to purchase the property and thinks we may be over paying.

Megan Bridges

- Would invite further conversation.
- Proper to have negotiation in executive session.
- Appraisal was \$3.6M. This is technically item 13, item 12 is the bonding authority.
- Can't vote on item 13 if you don't take-action on item 12.
- Need to decide on the borrowing before going to the council and taking a property by imminent domain.
- Price includes building, real estate, internal fixtures and lifts and is 125% above appraisal numbers.

Councilor Farwell

- The property assessment discrepancy makes it appear the property owner may not have been paying enough in taxes.
- Would prefer to go into executive session and wants the best price.

Councilor Thompson

- Was shocked by the lack of information provided to the council. No map of the property, layout and has zero understanding if the property is sufficient. City has over 100 buses and employee parking. This may to be enough space to accommodate everyone.
- Can't support an appropriation of \$5.5M. Needs further conversation.

Aldo Petronio

- City may look for additional land for the bus depot, that is adjacent to another property that would be helpful in storing buses.

Councilor Tavares

- Was the building built for car repair services? How big is the inside? Will the busses fit?
- Can you use the lifts for the busses?
- Why are you purchasing the property?

Aldo Petronio

- Doors open 12 feet.

- The lift will not accommodate the buses. We currently have a portable lift we can move until a permanent one can be placed.
- Will place busses to be able to have fire trucks fit through.
- City is currently leasing and would benefit to own.

Councilor Teixeira

- Asked if the city looked at other areas.
- How much are we saving owning vs leasing?
- This is a lot of money for tax payers, does not want to rush and feels the city should get more for the funds.
- Asked about K-Mart area.

Aldo Petronio

- Other properties have been reviewed but owners not willing to sell and did not want to place near residential homes due to the noise.
- Saving about \$100K annually and \$3.8M over 20 years.
- It was hard to get property that large. There is adjacent vacant land that we are looking at. Potential for a couple acres and DPW trucks could be brought for service. That appraised for \$1.1M
- K-Mart had a development that was to go there. It has changed but they are not willing to sell.

Councilor Asack

- Asked about the property adjacent to this property.
- Space is a concern for the price.
- Need to keep looking.
- How much to build a bus lift?

Aldo Petronio

- Adjacent property is 3.67 acres and appraised for \$1.1M, there is additional that equals 6.8 acres.
- Lifts are \$50-60,000.
- If we found other property without a building we could put a metal fabricated building on the property to house the equipment.

Councilor Rodrigues

- Has similar concerns and has a problem with the appraisals and the need for 3.
- Asked to speak with City Solicitor.
- How do we solicit and select the appraiser? Can we request another appraisal?
- Asked about the breakdown of the purchase.

Megan Bridges

- They do not personally know the appraisers. They get recommendations from business contacts.

- They have multiple appraisals to avoid favoritism.
- Gets the quotes and Procurement would reject.
- Reports are more 100 pages. Entire history, title exams. Has to do with size and development on the property.
- Commercial property appraisals being taken by imminent domain are not the same as residential appraisals. Completely different professionals that perform them.
- Happy to get a second opinion.

Councilor Rodrigues

- Questioned if they did their due diligence in searching for land if they are asking for help with finding something more appropriate.

Aldo Petronio

- Welcomes ideas for purchasing land. They have searched all commercial areas and many not willing to sell.
- Listed many properties that were out of range or not a good fit.
- Some owners will not lease when the funds state subject to appropriation.
- Brewster ambulance facility would be the best but will not sell, only lease.
- Fairground is a good spot and did 3 one-year leases because they were going to develop the property. They wanted to sell as one large parcel.
- We are looking at other options for the land.

Councilor Minichiello

- Appraisal is different than an assessment. Discussed purchase prices and the market and that there is a big difference.
- Wants to discuss in executive session to talk about pricing.
- Appraisers have strict criteria for each property and it shouldn't be a drastic change.
- Mentioned the additional space for buses at the fairground.
- Price will be more to cover what can't fit at this site right now.
- Postpone until additional invitees are able to attend the meeting.

Motion by Councilor Lally for an executive session meeting in a month, 2nd by Councilor Thompson.

Councilor D'Agostino

- Appreciated that uninvited guests answering questions.
- Was involved in the purchase of land in the past and doesn't want people to bully the city into paying more money.
- Wants to do the project as a completed proposal that meets the needs completely.
- Was frustrated that property goes quickly once on the market.

Councilor Thompson

- Wants time for everyone to come and be prepared to show the whole plan and estimated costs in a month. Wants a better understanding of the costs.

Aldo Petronio

- Correct and or could lease some of the buses at another location.
- City has been looking for over a year.

Having considered the same, motion by Councilor Minichiello to report POSTPONED, 2nd by Councilor Farwell. Motion carried by a hand vote.

13. Ordered: That the City of Brockton does hereby take in fee in accordance with M.G.L. ch.79 and/or other applicable law, the following described parcel of land, to wit:

1782 Main Street Parcel ID:119-002: for further reference see Plymouth County Registry of Deeds Book 19133, Page 29

We have considered and estimated the damages sustained by all persons who have not waived damages in their several estates and hereby determine and award the same as follows, to be paid from the bond amounts previously authorized by the City Council for purchase or taking of property for public safety and general municipal purposes.

PROPERTY/OWNER	AMOUNT
Owner: M Trust, 1782 Main Street	\$5,550,000.00

Said taking shall include all trees, soil, or fixtures thereon.

Invited: Megan Bridges, City Solicitor
Troy Clarkson, Chief Financial Officer

Having considered the same, motion by Councilor Minichiello to report POSTPONED, 2nd by Councilor Asack. Motion carried by a hand vote.

- 14 Ordered: In compliance with the provisions of the Election Laws, notice is hereby given that the City Preliminary will be held on Tuesday, September 19, 2023 and that the City Election will be held on Tuesday, November 7, 2023 in the following designated Polling Places:

Ward One	Precinct A	Housing Authority Community Room, Hawley Street
Ward One	Precinct B	West Junior High School Building, West Street
Ward One	Precinct C	Hancock School, Pearl Street
Ward One	Precinct D	Hancock School, Pearl Street
Ward Two	Precinct A	Barrett Russell School, 45 Oakdale St
Ward Two	Precinct B	Manning Towers, 45 Goddard Road
Ward Two	Precinct C	Brockton Public Library, Main Branch, 304 Main St
Ward Two	Precinct D	War Memorial Building, 156 West Elm Street
Ward Three	Precinct A	South Junior High School Building, Keith Avenue
Ward Three	Precinct B	South Junior High School Building, Keith Avenue
Ward Three	Precinct C	John F. Kennedy School Building, Ash Street
Ward Three	Precinct D	West Side Library, 540 Forest Avenue

Ward Four	Precinct A	Gilmore School, 150 Clinton Street
Ward Four	Precinct B	Gilmore School, 150 Clinton Street
Ward Four	Precinct C	Davis Elementary School, 380 Plain Street
Ward Four	Precinct D	Campello High Rise Apartments, 1380 Main Street
Ward Five	Precinct A	East Side Library, 54 Kingman Street
Ward Five	Precinct B	East Junior High School Building, Centre Street
Ward Five	Precinct C	Downey School, 55 Electric Avenue
Ward Five	Precinct D	Caffrey Towers, 755 Crescent Street
Ward Six	Precinct A	Brookfield School, 135 Jon Drive
Ward Six	Precinct B	Ashfield School Gymnasium, 225 Coe Road
Ward Six	Precinct C	Brookfield School, 135 Jon Drive
Ward Six	Precinct D	Brookfield School, 135 Jon Drive
Ward Seven	Precinct A	North Junior High School Building, Oak Street
Ward Seven	Precinct B	Belair Street High Rise, 105 Belair Street
Ward Seven	Precinct C	Sullivan Towers, 140 Colonel Bell Drive
Ward Seven	Precinct D	Raymond School, 125 Oak Street

The polls will be open at 7:00 A.M., and will be closed at 8:00 P.M.

Said voters will then in their respective polling places give in their votes each on one piece of paper to the Warden for the election of candidates for the following named office, viz: Mayor, Councilor At Large, Ward Councilors, and School Committee.

Invited: Cynthia Scrivani, Executive Director of Elections Commission

Motion by Councilor Farwell to waive reading of the polling locations, 2nd by Councilor Thompson Motion carried by a hand vote.

Cynthia Scrivani

- There is a change. The Council on Aging location will be moved to the Library.

Having considered the same, motion by Councilor Asack to report FAVORABLE, 2nd by Councilor Minichiello. Motion carried by a hand vote.

- 15 Ordered: Section 25B: Early voting; application for early voting ballots; early voting period, sites and lists; counting of early voting ballots
- (c)(1) The select board, board of selectmen, town council or city council of each city and town may vote to authorize early in-person voting for any other city or town preliminary or election not included in subsection(b). Such vote may only be taken after a request from not less than 50 percent of the registrars of the city or town recommending in-person early voting; provided, however, that such vote shall occur not less than 5 business days prior to the proposed beginning of early voting.
- (2) As part of the vote to allow early in-person voting under this subsection; a city or town shall set the early voting period to begin not sooner than 17 days before the

preliminary or election and end not later than 2 days preceding the preliminary or election.

(3) Early voting under this subsection shall be conducted during the usual business hours of each city or town clerk unless different hours are set as part of the vote to allow early in-person voting, including any weekend hours.

The Election Commissioners voted unanimously to have in-person early voting. The Commissioners respectfully request the council put it to a vote. According to mass general laws the council now has to vote on it.

Invited: Cynthia Scrivani, Executive Director of Elections Commission

Cynthia Scrivani

- There is state early voting but to have city early voting it must be voted upon.

Having considered the same, motion by Councilor Farwell to report FAVORABLE, 2nd by Councilor Asack. Motion carried by a hand vote.

- 16 Resolve: Be it resolved by the Brockton City Council to invite Rob May, Director of Planning and Economic Development for the City of Brockton, and area restauranters, to come before the Council to provide an update and discuss their vision of the Sycamore Grove project being proposed by the City of Brockton.

Invited: Rob May, Director of Planning and Economic Development

Joseph R. Angelo, Owner, Joe Angelo's

Chrismin Charlotte, Owner, Tamboo

Manuel Dasilva, Owner, Preto's Island Cuisine

Manuel Rodrigues, Co-Owner, Cristal

Tony Rodrigues, Co-Owner, Cristal

Rob May

- Mayor heard the concerns of the owners and met with them twice. Plans to have bi-weekly meetings to address concerns.
- Will be working for Dan Pollata as well as Beals and Thomas to work on construction cost changes and additional public meetings.

Councilor Asack

- Wants to make sure business owners agree with new updates.

Joseph Angelo

- Had a meeting with the Mayor. They are part of the meetings and thinks it will work for everyone.
- Concerns are being addressed.

Manuel Rodrigues

- Wanted to address the lack of parking that already exists.
- He is glad they are now part of the process regarding the vision of the project.

Councilor Thompson

- Will the Mayor have Council's involved in any of the meetings? The Councilor's should be involved considering they authorize funds.

Councilor Rodrigues

- What is this project about?

Rob May

- Started 2019 old bat terminal and has been used as parking since
- It is going to create a community green space area with family friendly activities to promote further growth in the area.

Councilor Rodrigues

- This is going to create vendors that will be in direct competition with the businesses that are already there.
- Is the plan for this to still be run by a non-profit?
- Who makes the decision to get the spot and managed?

Rob May

- This will be a place that vendors can sell snacks, light drinks, beer & soda.
- The intent is to compliment current businesses and is not competition.
- Parks is involved in long term maintenance. Revenue or rent would help offset any programming costs providing entertainment.
- Still in the process of organizing this area in the park. It could be yoga or a movie.

Councilor Rodrigues

- Wouldn't it be best to have the business owners at the table to make the decisions on this open space area?
- Create a collaboration.

Rob May

- The discussion is currently being worked on but it is ultimately the decision of the city. It is up to the Mayor to decide.
- Will bring it up as bi-weekly meetings and agree with a plan.

Councilor Rodrigues

- It shouldn't be up to just the mayor. We are trying to do what is best for the city.
- Suggested a rotating schedule and allow the existing businesses to take turns providing the services.
- Put in the resolve to make sure businesses are heard.

Councilor Farwell

- Why did it take 5 years?
- This started in 2018 so we discussed funds.
- There will be a sound stage and there will be an increase in density. What are we doing about the sound and impact on residents?

Rob May

- Timeline is frustrating and city has limited amount of capital funds to make improvements on municipal property.
- When ARPA funds came it supported creating open space areas to gather and it became more of a reality.

Councilor Teixeira

- Asked what would be sold.
- License commission would need to approve a liquor license.
- Ana's Palace can hold 400 people. Need parking for new businesses.
- Why not have the 4 established business provide instead of a non-profit that won't pay taxes?
- Wants the business to provide services for a program event space.

Rob May

- City would need to go through procurement. Legitimate that the owners be part of the process.
- Goal was to provide space, open downtown, and for existing properties to expand current out door facilities.

Councilor D'Agostino

- Where will everyone park?
- What is the capacity for Ana's space?

Rob May

- Currently about 700 parking space near Sycamore Grove.
- Adams garage holds 400 cars and the mayor has committed that the garage will be open 24 hours for residential overnight parking.
- Ana's Palace has capacity of 800 people but not to be fresh, but not everyone will be taking a vehicle.
- Keeping Adams garage open is good idea but we are also looking to increase garage space with the Parking Authority.
- Mix of long-term parking and convenience parking.

Councilor Tavares

- Allow current restaurants an opportunity to work with the city to bring more business to the area.

Councilor Farwell

- Would like to see the meeting notes of the Mayor and future plans.
- Postpone for a month.

Tony Rodrigues

- Appreciates the meeting with the Mayor.
- They need as much parking as possible.
- Bringing more greenspace would be wonderful and is happy to part of the process.
- The current design needs to add more parking and can still bring greenspace.

Having considered the same, motion by Councilor Farwell to report POSTPONED, 2nd by Councilor Thompson. Motion carried by a hand vote.