

**REPORT – ORDINANCE COMMITTEE**  
**November 23, 2021**

The Standing Committee on Ordinances and Rules to which was referred the following reports as follows:

**#1 on agenda**

having considered the same, report TABLED by Motion of Councilor Thompson, 2<sup>nd</sup> by Councilor Monahan.

Next the Committee considered the following:

**#2 on agenda**

having considered the same, report TABLED by Motion of Councilor Thompson, 2<sup>nd</sup> by Councilor Monahan.

Next the Committee considered the following:

**#3 on agenda**

having considered the same, report TABLED by Motion of Councilor Monahan, 2<sup>nd</sup> by Councilor Rodrigues.

Next the Committee considered the following:

**#4 on agenda**

having considered the same, report FAVORABLE by Motion of Councilor Monahan, 2<sup>nd</sup> by Councilor Nicastro.

Next the Committee considered the following:

**#5 on agenda**

having considered the same, report POSTPONED until the next Ordinance Meeting by Motion of Councilor Thompson, 2<sup>nd</sup> by Councilor Nicastro.

**MINUTES – ORDINANCE COMMITTEE**  
**November 23, 2021**

The Standing Committee on Ordinances and Rules was called to order at 6:41 p.m. by Councilor Eaniri with Councilors Eaniri, Monahan, Nicastro, Rodrigues, and Thompson present.

Agenda read into the record.

Motion by Councilor Monahan to take # 3 out of order. 2<sup>nd</sup> by Rod. All.

The Committee first considered the following:

**#3 on agenda**

Comments by Councilor Monahan  
(to table)

Motion to report TABLED by Councilor Monahan, 2<sup>nd</sup> by Councilor Rodrigues. Motion carried unanimously.

Motion by Councilor Monahan to take Item #5 out of order, 2<sup>nd</sup> by Councilor Rodrigues. Motion carried unanimously.

Next the Committee considered the following:

**#5 on agenda**

Comments by Councilor Eaniri  
(Department Heads have not received an increase over the last couple of years, credit to Councilor Farwell for putting this together)

Comments by Councilor Farwell  
(re amendments)

Motion to amend includes addition of positions to the pay plan chart for Assessors-Member -Full Time, Assistant Solicitor – Full Time, Library Director, Traffic Commission Member, B.E.M.A. Director, Deputy Director, B.E.M.A. and Communications Director B.E.M.A.

Motion includes effective date and need for supplemental appropriation by Mayor.

Motion to amend by Councilor Eaniri, 2<sup>nd</sup> by Councilor Thompson. Motion carried unanimously.

Comments by Councilor Farwell

(re Collins Institute study, wages below comparable cities, hard to attract and retain people for employment. We want career professionals. Not able to fill positions. We do not have competitive wages. We do not want revolving door of employees leaving after they have experience. Looking at what we need to do, we looked at what other cities and towns do. The positions we are talking about today. End of last salary step Mayor can grant up to 3% step, consistent with what school does. Annual performance reviews. Stipends for commissions on a per meeting basis. Grouped functions together. Took CFO and coupled it with City Solicitor as chief legal officer for salary reasons. Compared liked duties and responsibility, like the superintendent of building and the DPW commissioner. Parking Authority Director a little more than Planning Director, as it's not a 24/7 position where the Parking Authority Director's position may occasionally. Identifying fair salary levels, not about personalities and friendships. Looking at future of Brockton)

Comments by Councilor Monahan  
(re city comparison)

Comments by Councilor Farwell  
(Lowell, Waltham, Worcester, Framingham, Newton, spreadsheet for review. Percentage consideration for assistant positions as a feeder system, 5% difference in steps to try to catch us up with other cities and towns and where the school department is. Stipend for wardens and poll workers)

Comments by Councilor Rodrigues  
(wants to help department heads out, but need to be realistic, can't support it, raising salary by \$50,000 for parking director, some department heads are underpaid)

Comments by Councilor Farwell  
(categorizing it as a raise, undervaluation in city)

Comments by Councilor Rodrigues  
(starting salary positions are low)

Comments by Councilor Farwell  
(parking director takes in revenue, manages account, what is being proposed is being paid in another city)

Comments by Councilor Rodrigues  
(interested in a case by case basis, people in community hurting, consideration for specialty not yet how many people they oversee)

Comments by Councilor Thompson  
(more comfortable with a percentage increase, likes the idea of Mayor being about to increase from there on, fiscal increase each year?)

Comments by Troy Clarkson, CFO

(starting date needs to be considered, amendments speak to salary scale, as proposed \$500,000 for the entirety of this proposal)

Comments by Councilor Thompson

(would like to hear from the Mayor)

Comments by Councilor Farwell

(not where we should be in paying our professionals, school side salaries, HR on school side making over \$160,000 a year, need a drastic change)

Comments by Councilor Thompson

(4 steps?)

Comments by Councilor Farwell

(used 4 steps so then it gets kicked to Mayor because of performance evaluation and flexibility to kick in sooner rather than later, would go to the next step that gives you at least a \$2,000 increase)

Comments by Councilor Nicastro

(Collins Institute study, looking at comparable cities, not afraid of increases if they are fair in the market place, hole is set up that union positions get increases tied to bargaining and ordinance positions do not have that luxury, annual review by Mayor is important, friendly resolve to have department heads to report to the Council from time-to-time, compensation for board members?)

Comments by Councilor Farwell

(hours per meeting, stipends, chair has to write decisions, some boards get stipend, just not uniform or consistent)

Comments by Councilor Eaniri

(supports this, 4-5 years without an increase, able to give them something, not going to nit-pick, it's time, last several months giving out contract money for negotiations, forth coming with school side, we are going to start to lose some of these people, a few may hit higher but it's been tough for everybody, extra money around and available, financial planning)

Comments by Councilor Farwell

(diversity and inclusion manager, CFO, city solicitor, the values in the proposal have merit as to what Brockton should be paying, we've sat back while other communities have gone ahead of Brockton to Brockton's detriment, if not this then what, if not now then when)

Comments by Councilor Rodrigues

(health director, \$60k?)

Comments by Councilor Farwell  
(new position, this is the new position)

Comments by Councilor Rodrigues  
(yes we can give a raise but we can be responsible about it, \$50,000 raise is not that, lost HR director because we wouldn't go to \$112,000, affluent communities comparison)

Comments by Councilor Rodrigues  
(parking director)

Comments by Councilor Nicastro  
(financial implications)

Comments by Troy Clarkson, CFO  
(can't afford not to do this, positions remain unfilled)

Comments by Councilor Farwell  
(step is 5% between each, for longevity, skill level)

Comments by Councilor Thompson  
(re percentage across the board?, push back, instead of looking outside of Brockton, maybe incorporate a percent increase, trying to find solution forward because of optics)

Comments by Councilor Farwell  
(percentage doesn't work because we are no where near the school department, we can look at other options, show the increase for the current council)

Comments by Troy Clarkson, CFO  
(not an all or nothing proposal, could make a position adjustment or for several if you do not feel they make the optics, example for Marty Brophy, has been Treasurer/Collector for 10 years and he has taken a "0" 5 of those year, inequity for most senior employees, well compensated for their position due to the scope of their service, supports Councilor Farwell's proposal, need to retract and retain the best, tying performance to raises is important, it's motivates and engages, proposals have support behind them, have to consider external equity, significant amount of work in the proposal, supported by the data, looking at market value for a position, not a person, believes these salaries are in line, internal equity issue for those who have been here for years longer, easy to resolve, a position to add for the Mayor)

Comments by Councilor Thompson  
(wants to go through the numbers)

Comments by Troy Clarkson, CFO

(might sound like a significant increase, but still not competitive with other towns, believes the problems with recruitment and retention will remain)

Comments by Councilor Monahan  
(benefits from the union in terms of vacation)

Comments by Troy Clarkson, CFO  
(union department head, vacation time and sick, differences are significant, 3 extra personal days, greatest risk is in doing nothing)

Comments by Councilor Monahan  
(also a loss of value because the additional benefits are left, also makes it difficult for recruitment)

Comments by Councilor Farwell  
(can take a position out because the parking director is paid through a separate fund)

Comments by Councilor Rodrigues  
(retention issue, need to treat people with respect, need to change culture in Brockton, need a plan to retain people, school department might not be doing it right with their salaries, salaries should be on a case by case basis, worried about bankrupting the city)

Comments by Councilor Eaniri  
(re another meeting)

Comments by Councilor Thompson  
(legitimate arguments, need time to digest)

Comments by Troy Clark, CFO  
(suggests meeting next week for answering questions)

Motion to POSTPONE until the next Ordinance Committee meeting (Wednesday December 1, 2021 at 6:30 p.m.) by Councilor Thompson, 2<sup>nd</sup> by Councilor Nicastro. Motion carried unanimously.

Motion to take item #4 out of order by Councilor Monahan, 2<sup>nd</sup> by Councilor Thompson. Motion carried unanimously.

Next the Committee considered the following:

**#4 on agenda**

Comments by Mr. Hill, DPW

(already before the council, establish fund so not duplicating paving funds, so can use for streets that can't be paved with chapter 90 funds, some utilities are obligated to make payments)

Motion to recommend FAVORABLE by Motion of Councilor Monahan, 2<sup>nd</sup> by Councilor Nicastro. Motion carried unanimously.

### **#1 on agenda**

Motion by Councilor Thompson to waive reading of item, 2<sup>nd</sup> by Councilor Nicastro. Motion carried unanimously.

Motion to TABLE by Motion of Councilor Thompson, 2<sup>nd</sup> by Councilor Monahan. Motion carried unanimously.

Next the Committee considered the following:

### **#2 on agenda**

Motion by Councilor Thompson to waive reading of item, 2<sup>nd</sup> by Councilor Nicastro. Motion carried unanimously.

Motion to TABLE by Motion of Councilor Thompson, 2<sup>nd</sup> by Councilor Monahan. Motion carried unanimously.

Motion to adjourn by Councilor Thompson, 2<sup>nd</sup> by Councilor Monahan at 8:34 p.m. Motion carried unanimously.

The meeting was adjourned at 8:34 p.m.